

## IX) *Lisha Achar Lisha*

Is one allowed to prepare tahini or dilute it on Shabbat? Is there any problem of *lisha* in adding oil to a salad made of finely-chopped pieces?

### **Kneading Mustard-Seed in the Gemara**

**Gemara** (140a): *If mustard is kneaded on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may mash it either by hand or with a utensil, and one may pour honey into it. One may not beat it, but one may mix it...*

**Bei'ur Halakha** 321:15 - the Gemara is talking about mustard-seed which has been mixed with a liquid and kneaded on Erev Shabbat. The Gemara allows one, on Shabbat, to add a liquid to the mixture in order to dilute and soften it or to add honey to it, as long as one mixes gently and not vigorously.

**Rif** (58a), **Rambam** (22:12) and **most Rishonim**: the Gemara deals with mustard which was crushed before Shabbat but not mixed with liquid or kneaded; nevertheless, the Gemara allows one to mix liquid in it on Shabbat and knead it, as long as one mixes gently and not vigorously. The phrasing in the Gemara, "If mustard is **kneaded**", refers not to the *melakha* of *lisha* itself, but rather to mustard that is "kneaded" with its natural juice (**Peri Megadim**, *Mishbetzot Zahav*, 319:13).

**Sefer Ha-teruma** (Ch. 220) disputes this and understands that case as referring to a situation in which one puts in water before Shabbat but does not mix the mustard-seed and the water. The **Terumat Ha-deshen** (Ch. 53) explains that the **Sefer Ha-teruma** rules like **Rabbi**, and therefore he holds that in any case one may not allow putting in liquid on Shabbat, and the fact that one changes the method of mixing does not make adding liquid permissible, so that we have no choice but to say that the Gemara is talking about a case in which the liquid was put in before Shabbat.

**Bei'ur Halakha** finds the approach of these *Rishonim* very difficult:  
*In truth, this requires a great deal of study: how did the Sages allow the very kneading, which is a Torah prohibition, on the basis of such as small shinnui, namely that one does not beat it vigorously?...we are talking about mustard-seed to which a) a liquid was added, after which b) the mixture was kneaded on Erev Shabbat, as is the simple meaning of the Gemara's phrasing. Therefore one is allowed to knead the mixture once again on Shabbat, because ein lisha achar lisha; nevertheless, there is a rabbinic prohibition to beat it vigorously, because this action is similar to lisha.*

*The mustard has been kneaded while it was still day... Therefore, in mashing it now on Shabbat, one is not doing an act of lisha at all... This*

*mashing of the mustard merely makes it very soft, so that it can be drunk, and this act is not called lisha... Thus, mashing in water is the opposite, as one separates the parts which adhere through lisha. Consequently, there is no prohibition in this at all, except that beating it vigorously is a bit similar to lisha.*

### **Applying Ein Lisha Achar Lisha**

As we have said, in addition to the allowance to knead an existing mass, one can add **liquids** to it or **dilute** it, because this is the opposite act of the *melakha* of *lash*. However, one must not add **dry** substances to the mass, even if the mass was formed before Shabbat, because **one is binding dry substances to this mass on Shabbat**, and this is an act of *lisha*. Therefore, it is clear that one must not, for example, add flour to existing dough.

According to this, it is permissible to mix on Shabbat **tahini which was prepared before Shabbat**, and one is allowed **to add water to it**. Similarly, one is allowed to mix the oil on top of a jar of peanut butter with the contents below. One may also mix the oil which floats on top of eggplant salad back into the mixture.

What about *charoset*, the paste made for the Pesach Seder? **As long as it has been initially prepared before the holiday starts**, one is allowed to add wine or another liquid (even when the Seder takes place on Friday night).

However, it is appropriate to avoid preparing unprocessed tahini on Shabbat. Though it has already been mixed during its processing in the factory long before this Shabbat, it has only been “kneaded” with its natural juices, and it is not clear that this is considered true *lisha*. In addition, the preparation of tahini improves the mixture and makes it thicker.

### If the Second *Lisha* Enhances

When it comes to *ein lisha achar lisha*, we must ask: **from an essential point of view**, is it conceivable for there to be a prohibition of *lisha* once *lisha* has already been done? Perhaps *ein lisha achar lisha* applies only **because there is no enhancement or innovation in the second *lisha***, but if there is any enhancement, it would be forbidden. A practical distinction will arise between these possibilities within the view of **Rabbi**, who believes that for putting water in one is liable for *lash*: can one be liable for the kneading as well, or perhaps after the water is put in and *lisha* has been accomplished, *ein lisha achar lisha*?

As we have seen above, according to the **Bei'ur Halakha** (321:14, s.v. *Ein Megabbelin*), even if the water has been put in on Erev Shabbat and only the kneading is done on Shabbat, one is liable even according to the view of Rabbi, and we do not say that this is *lisha achar lisha*, since the kneading improves the dough and makes the two substances better adhere to each other. The **Bei'ur**

**Halakha** brings a proof from the Yerushalmi (7:2), which says that even one who rolls dough is liable, despite the fact that the dough has already been kneaded. This implies that one is liable even for improving existing dough. On the other hand, the **Chazon Ish** (58:5) writes that, according to **Rabbi**, one is not liable for kneading because *ein lisha achar lisha*, and one cannot bring a proof from the Yerushalmi, because rolling is a separate act from kneading.

It turns out that according to the **Bei'ur Halakha**, the entire rule of *ein lisha achar lisha* is only applicable **when the second *lisha* adds nothing significant**; however, if the second *lisha* enhances the mixture, one is liable for it. (According to him, it may be that the same applies even if one actually kneads before Shabbat — if the second *lisha* improves the attachment of the substances in the mass in a significant way, one is liable for it.) On the other hand, according to the **Chazon Ish**, we rule categorically that *ein lisha achar lisha*, and only for totally new actions (e.g., rolling) may one be liable after *lisha*.

#### Summary

**In conclusion, the general principle is that *ein lisha achar lisha*.** Therefore, if one mixes a solid with a liquid and kneads them before Shabbat, it is permissible to knead them more thoroughly on Shabbat. In this case, one can even **add water** and knead, since this act does not make the mass more cohesive; on the contrary, this act separates it. (Still, one cannot add **dry substances** to an agglomerated mass and knead the mixture). Therefore, it is permissible and to mix tahini which was prepared before Shabbat (though it is inappropriate to prepare unprocessed tahini on Shabbat) or to mix the oil which floats on top of peanut butter with the rest and the like.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **X) *Lisha* of Pulped Produce**

The regular *lisha* is that of flour and water or other substances with liquids and the like. Does the prohibition of *lash* apply when one adds liquid to pulped vegetables? Is there a problem to add wine on Shabbat to crushed walnuts and apples which are designated for *charosef*? Can one add oil to a finely-chopped salad?

Gemara (140a):

*If mustard is kneaded on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may mash it either by hand or with a utensil, and one may pour honey into it. One may not beat it, but one may mix it.*

*Cress which has been ground on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may put oil and vinegar into it... One may not beat it, but one may mix it.*

*Garlic which has been pressed on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may put beans or grits in it. One may not grind it, but one may mix it.*

**Rashi:** “One may not beat it’ — as one beats eggs in a bowl with a spoon, in the way of beating, that one strikes it vigorously.” The Gemara allows one to mix **pulped vegetables** with liquids or beans and grits with **pressed** garlic, as long as one mixes gently and not vigorously.

**Bei’ur Halakha** (321:15, s.v. *Yakhol le’arvo*) is very perplexed by this allowance:

In truth, this requires a great deal of study: how did the Sages allow the very kneading, which is a Torah prohibition, on the basis of such as small *shinnui*, namely that one does not beat it vigorously?

It may be that the answer is that generally one cannot allow *lisha* with a *shinnui* (alteration) such as this, however in the cases mentioned in the Gemara, there is no problem of *lisha*, or at least there is no prohibition of *lisha* from the Torah. The prohibition of *lisha* is **fusing and binding** substances. Pulped vegetables that are mixed with liquids do not turn into one unit, and thus the act of mixing them cannot be considered *lisha*; as such, one is allowed to mix it gently.

**Chazon Ish** (58:4) explains why this is permitted along similar lines:

*It is possible that even if one beats it vigorously, it is only [prohibited] rabbinically, and even if we say that beating it vigorously is [prohibited by] Torah [law], one must say that mixing it is not a full-fledged violation of lash. This is not based on shinnui: it is less cohesive than ashes, as they become like miry clay when mixed with water... but minced vegetables are not miry, but discrete. However, when one beats them vigorously, it may be considered lisha by Torah law.*

The **Chazon Ish** deliberated here between two possible understandings. According to the first possibility, vigorously beating pulped vegetables is forbidden only **rabbinically**, since it does not create a true mass, and therefore when one makes a **shinnui** one can allow it to be mixed gently. On the other hand, according to the second possibility, beating pulped vegetables vigorously creates a true mass, and the act is forbidden **by the Torah**. However, mixing vegetables like these gently does not create an agglomerated mass at all, as the vegetables remain separate, and therefore the matter is permissible. (According to this view, the allowance to mix gently is not based on the law of *shinnui*, and *lisha* is not at all applicable to a mixture such as this.)

Either way, the allowance to gently mix pulped vegetables with a liquid is based on the fact that one does not create a new single entity, and therefore there is no true *lisha* in this case.

However, there are *Rishonim* who limit this allowance in a significant way.

The **Sefer Ha-teruma** (Ch. 220) writes that according to the Yerushalmi (7:2), that the allowance to knead pulped vegetables gently only applies if one puts in the water before Shabbat, but on Shabbat itself there is no allowance to add a liquid to pulped vegetables. The **Semag** also mentions this limitation (Prohibition 65, *Lash*).

In his Responsa (Ch. 53), the **Terumat Ha-deshen** explains that this view is based on the view of Rabbi, that putting in water is forbidden by the Torah because of *lash*, and the *shinnui* done with kneading does not help to permit putting in the water (unless one makes a *belila rakka* and mixes the substances in the reverse order, as we have explained in earlier *shiurim*).

As such, according to the **Rif**, the **Rambam** and the **Rosh**, who rule in accordance with the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, there is no need to limit the words of the Gemara, and it is permissible to add liquids to pulped vegetables and to knead them gently on Shabbat itself. This is what the **Yere'im** (Ch. 274, 134a) and the **Or Zarua** (Vol. II, Ch. 61) write: the Gemara's allowance applies even to adding liquids to pulped vegetables on Shabbat itself.

**Shulchan Arukh** (321:15-16) cites both views:

**If mustard is kneaded on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may mash it either by hand or with a utensil, and one may pour honey into it. One may not beat it vigorously, but one may mix it bit by bit.**

**Cress which has been ground on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may put oil and vinegar into it. One may not beat it, but one may mix it. Garlic which has been pressed on Erev Shabbat, the next day one may put beans or grits in it. One may not grind it, but one may mix it...**

**There are those who say that it is only permissible to mix a liquid in mustard if it has been put in before Shabbat, but on Shabbat, it is forbidden to put liquids in crushed mustard or garlic because of *lash*.**

*Gloss [of the Rema]: If one puts in the food first and afterwards the vinegar or wine and mixes it with one's finger, it is permissible, because it is a shinnui, just as by shatita above. This is the custom: to allow this with a shinnui.*

The **Shulchan Arukh** first quotes the view of **most Rishonim**, who allow one to put a liquid into vegetables and to mix it gently on Shabbat — following the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda** — and after this, he cites the view of the **Sefer Ha-teruma** and the **Semag** as the second view (“those who say”). They limit the allowance to a case in which one puts in the liquid before Shabbat, following the view of Rabbi. Since he brings the lenient view without attribution

and then the stringent view of “those who say,” it appears that his essential inclination is to be lenient. We have already seen that this is the view of the Sefardic halakhic authorities — to rule in accordance with the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**.

From the words of the **Rema**, on the other hand, it appears that he is concerned about the view of “those who say”, who follow Rabbi’s view, and he does not allow mixing pulped vegetables unless one puts the liquid in on Erev Shabbat. We have already seen that a number of the Sefardic halakhic authorities also follow this approach, including the **Ben Ish Chai** and the **Kaf Ha-chayim**. However, the **Rema** notes that, even according to the stringent view, one may put the liquid in on Shabbat itself if one makes a *belila rakka* and changes the sequence of ingredients, as we have seen in our discussion of *lisha* with a *shinnui*.

It turns out that according to the mainstream view of the **Sefardim**, one may add a liquid to pulped vegetables and mix them gently on Shabbat, even though it creates a *belila ava*, while according to the **Ashkenazim** (and some of the Sefardim) one should not add a liquid to pulped vegetables and make a *belila ava* on Shabbat; rather one should add the liquid before Shabbat and mix it gently on Shabbat (or make a *belila rakka* with a *shinnui* in the ingredient sequence). Indeed, as we have already seen, if one could not have added the liquid before Shabbat (for example, the food would have gone bad or one had forgotten to do so), one may be lenient in accordance with the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda** and add the liquid on Shabbat itself. In this case, one must mix with a *shinnui* or gently, and it is best to change the sequence of ingredients as well.

In fact, these laws relate to every *belila ava*, not only pulped vegetables; however, pulped vegetables have an added leniency of **mixing gently** (i.e., one mixes it normally — not vigorously, but rather with a slow, circular motion). Generally, this *shinnui* is not considered sufficient, with the requirement being either to whip it crosswise, to shake the vessel or to mix it bit-by-bit. However, one may be lenient and mix pulped vegetables normally and gently, since the Gemara explicitly states that this is permitted for them (see **Chazon Ish** 58:8, s.v. *Ke-shekkoteshin*).

### ***Lisha* of Chopped Vegetables**

The **Mishna Berura** (321:68) writes, based on the **Taz** (321:12,) that in this respect, one must distinguish between two levels of chopping:

When it comes to lettuce, one need not be concerned about this, since it is never minced; however, when we mince a radish or pickled cucumbers, pour on vinegar or another liquid and then mix it all together, one must be careful not to mix it vigorously with a spoon, or to shake it in the vessel itself. Preferably, one should be stringent and put the vinegar in the

vessel first and then the food.

According to him, if vegetables are **chopped up very finely**, so that mixing the liquid in causes them to adhere, one must treat them as stringently as pulped vegetables, and therefore one should not add liquid on Shabbat itself. If it is impossible to prepare it on Erev Shabbat, one may add the liquid on Shabbat and mix it gently, but it is preferable to change the sequence of ingredients. However, if **the pieces are somewhat larger**, and they do not form one mass, there is no problem of *lisha* at all.

### Practical Halakha

According to this, there is no problem to add liquid to a **vegetable salad** or **fruit salad** and to mix it normally, because the contents of the salad are not chopped very finely. (Even if they are chopped in such a way as to create a problem of *tochen*, they still do not adhere in the presence of a liquid). Similarly, it is permissible to add **dressing to a lettuce salad** and mix it up, and one may add **mayonnaise to small pieces of potatoes** (since they are not cut very finely) and mix them normally. One may also be lenient about **carrot salad** and add orange juice and the like, because there is no real cohesion of different parts. (Still, the salad may at times be cut very finely, and it is appropriate to mix it gently).

Similarly, it is permissible to add **cream to chopped strawberries**. If the strawberries are **pulped**, and by putting in a bit of cream, one causes them to adhere, one should mix gently. However, if one puts a lot of cream in, the strawberries do not adhere and merely give a taste to the cream; consequently, one is able to mix it normally.

Similarly, it is permissible to mix **leaves of spices in cheese or hummus**, because this does not create an agglomerated mass (the leaves scatter and do not adhere to each other), but merely imparts taste.

***Lisha of Pulped or Cut Produce***

Vegetables which are cut into somewhat large pieces, which do not become one mass

Vegetables which are pulped or cut very small, so that when one mixes in them, a sort of mass is formed

There is no problem of *lisha* at all, and one may add liquid and mix normally.

One may mix it gently

Therefore, one may add juice or sauce to a regular fruit or vegetable salad. One may add dressing to a lettuce salad or mayonnaise to potato salad.

**Yere'im, Or Zarua:**

One may put in the liquid on Shabbat itself and mix gently (following **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda's** view).

**Sefer ha-Teruma and Semag (based on the Yerushalmi):**

One may mix gently only if one adds the liquid on Erev Shabbat (following Rabbi's view).

Ruling of the **Shulchan Arukh** and most Sefardic authorities

Ruling of the **Rema** and the Ashkenazim (and some Sefardim)

Even those who forbid this allow one to put the liquid in on Shabbat and to prepare a *belila rakka* with a change in the sequence of ingredients. If the food will go bad if it is prepared before Shabbat, or one has forgotten to do so, one may add liquid and prepare a *belila ava* on Shabbat itself. One must stir gently, and it is preferable to change the sequence of ingredients.



## XI) *Lisha* of Cooked Foods

Is one allowed to add sauce to rice and mix it up? May one mix breadcrumbs or matza meal with liquids? Is one permitted to do these actions normally, or does one need a *shinnui* (alteration) — and if so, what kind?

The **Rambam**, in his *Responsa* (Blau Edition, Ch. 305, cited by the **Beit Yosef**, end of Ch. 321), raises the following question:

*Question: A pot of grits is usually left on the stove over Shabbat [evening]. On the next morning, one takes the pot off of the stove, puts a wooden ladle in and stirs it a great deal, mixing it up and splashing it with the wooden ladle against the walls of the pot or in a bowl, until the meat, grits and water have been thoroughly blended. At the end, [the mixture] becomes thick, as it all becomes one mass. Sometimes the water is removed from the top and after that it is mixed, and sometimes hot water is added, as much as is needed. Are all of these actions prohibited or permitted?*

*Answer: Certainly, this is all allowed... if one is allowed to finish preparing parched ears, which require pulverizing, [one may certainly finish preparing] grits, which have already been pulverized and fully cooked; all they are missing is mixing alone, so surely should it be permissible! ... these grits do not require pounding, because they have already been thoroughly pounded in a mortar and fully cooked, and all they are missing is a bit of pulverizing and mixing. Putting the water into the pot is permitted as well...*

**Shulchan Arukh** rules (321:19) as well.

In this question, there are different factors to consider: stirring, grinding (*techina*; the *melakha* is known as *tochen*) and kneading. As we have seen, the **Rambam** believes that mashing the grits is not forbidden because of *tochen*, since the grits are already crushed and mashed, and all they require is a bit of pulverizing. However, why is there no prohibition of *lash*?

### ***Bishul* Precludes the Prohibition of *Lash***

In fact, the **Bach** (end of Ch. 321) challenges this ruling of the **Rambam**, and he writes that halakhically one may not beat the food vigorously, as is implied by the **Rambam**; rather, he rules that one must mix it in **gently**, as we have seen above concerning pulped vegetables. The **Magen Avraham** (321:28) rules accordingly. The **Taz** (ibid. 14), on the other hand, disputes this and explains why one may act more leniently in this case, even beating the mixture vigorously:

In that case, there was no liquid originally, before Shabbat; this is not true in this case, since it was fully cooked before they were mixed.

**Chazon Ish (58:9):**

Apparently, just as *bishul* precludes it from the *melakha* of *techina*, since its *techina* is easy and it is not considered to be a *melakha*, similarly it is not considered to be *lisha*. However, if the grits are dry, it may be that it is forbidden to put liquid on them and to mix them. However, if there is a bit of liquid before Shabbat, it appears that one may put in more on Shabbat.

According to this approach, just as the prohibition of *tochen* is not applicable to a cooked food, since the food is very soft and grinding it is no longer a significant act, so too the prohibition of *lash* is not applicable to items which have already been cooked together. The prohibition of *lash* addresses the binding of separate substances, each of which has previously stood on its own, while here the different substances in the pot have been mashed and softened and become part of one cooked food, so that the *lisha* which joins them together more thoroughly is not such a significant act.

The **Chazon Ish** goes further and explains that it may be that only if there is a bit of moisture in the cooked food is it permissible to knead it and even add more water to it, but if the cooked food has become totally dry (for example, if one wants to add water to dry rice and mix it up), this would perhaps be forbidden. The reasoning behind this is that when the cooked food dries up, every part of it stands on its own, and therefore mixing it is considered an important act of binding and kneading.

At the end of this passage, the **Chazon Ish** adds a point that may indicate a new direction or may fit in with his initial view:

However, when it comes to cooked food, even setting this aside, *lisha* can never be applicable, because the liquid does not fuse discrete elements together; on the contrary, it dilutes the thick.

In other words, the prohibition of *lash* exists when a person uses a liquid in order to combine and to bind items which are separate from each other; when it comes to a cooked food, one does not stick the different pieces to each other, but softens every element in its own right until it loses its identity, forming an agglomerated mass and becoming mixed with the other parts.

**Mere Tikkun Okhel**

**Bei'ur Halakha** (321:14, s.v. *Shema*): There is no Torah prohibition in kneading a cooked item, since it is fit for eating as it is, and its *lisha* is only *tikkun okhel* (food preparation) and *derekh akhila* (the way of eating):

*It appears to me that the basis for this allowance lies in the view of Tosafot. Once the parched ears are dried in the oven and made fit for eating, they are considered like a baked or cooked item. Therefore, even though one adds water and then kneads it, this is not considered like the melakha of lisha; rather, it is mere tikkun okhel, because this is its derekh akhila. It is considered like sauce put on a cooked food, and this is not a melakha by Torah law.*

The **Bei'ur Halakha** is discussing flour which comes from parched ears of grain (*kemach kali*, which is a bit like matza meal — see **Taz**, *ibid.* 11). The **Rambam** (21:33) and the **Shulchan Arukh** (321:14) imply that kneading flour such as this is not forbidden by the Torah. What is the reason?

The **Bei'ur Halakha** explains that since the flour is **baked and edible**, kneading it is not considered a significant act but **mere tikkun okhel**, akin to pouring sauce on a cooked food, and there is no Torah prohibition in this. What arises from this explanation is that he understands that the essence of the *melakha* of *lisha* is the preparation of an agglomerated mass for **cooking or baking**, and when a mass is already edible as is, there is no Torah prohibition of *lash* in mixing it.

However, as the Gemara (156a) indicates, although there is no prohibition from the Torah to knead *kemach kali*, there is a rabbinic prohibition to do so; only kneading *kemach kali* bit-by-bit, i.e., in smaller quantities than that which one is accustomed to knead on weekdays, is actually permitted. The **Rambam** (*ibid.*) writes that the reason for the prohibition is the concern that someone may come to knead regular flour. Aside from this, the Gemara indicates that this allowance follows the view of Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda only, but in the view of Rabbi, there is no allowance to knead *kemach kali* (in a *belila ava*, thick mixture) even bit-by-bit, since the very adding of water is problematic in his view. This is how the **Magen Avraham** (321:18) and **Mishna Berura** (52) rule: halakhically, we are concerned with the view of Rabbi, and consequently one must not knead *kemach kali*.

Even so, the **Shulchan Arukh** (321:19) and the **Mishna Berura** (77) allow kneading cooked vegetables even in great quantities. It appears that only when dealing with **a substance which is similar to flour**, such as *kemach kali* (or matza meal), one must knead a small quantity only. (In any case, for those who rule like Rabbi, it is totally forbidden, because adding the water itself violates a Torah prohibition.) However, when it comes to cooked vegetables, which are not like flour at all, the Sages did not ban this, and it is permissible to knead them even in great quantities.

**Mishna Berura** (*ibid.*) stresses, following the view of the **Bach** and the **Magen Avraham** : one should stir such a mixture **gently**. By contrast, the **Chazon Ish** (58:9, s.v. *Siman*) writes that one may even beat it vigorously, as the

Rambam's responsum indicates.

### Somewhat Hard Vegetables

It turns out that there are two different reasons to allow one to knead cooked vegetables. According to the **Chazon Ish**, after the vegetables are soft, their mixing **is not considered an act of *lisha***. On the other hand, according to the **Bei'ur Halakha**, there is an **act of *lisha***, but in terms of the **result**, no *lisha* exists in this case, because *lisha* is preparation for cooking and baking, while here the vegetables are already cooked and edible.

This question will be borne out in a practical ramification in the case of **cooked vegetables which are still somewhat hard**: according to the **Chazon Ish**, it may be that the allowance is only for very soft vegetables, but with hard vegetables there is a concern of *lisha*, while according to the **Bei'ur Halakha**, with every cooked food, there is no prohibition of *lisha* (but one should mix it gently).

**Is it permissible to add sauce to rice and to mix it?** From the abovementioned ruling of the **Chazon Ish**, it emerges that when the rice is dry and hard, there is a concern for the prohibition of *lisha*, and according to the **Bei'ur Halakha**, one may mix gently anything which is cooked. However, it may be that according to all the views, it is permissible to mix water with rice, since generally the water does not bind with the grains of rice; rather, it adds taste and moisture in them.

### Summary

In conclusion, according to the **Rambam**, it is permissible to knead cooked vegetables. The halakhic authorities differ whether one can knead any cooked vegetable (this is what the **Mishna Berura** seems to indicate) or perhaps only if those which are very soft and moist (this is what appears to be the view of the **Chazon Ish**). Aside from the question of *lisha*, the question of the prohibition of *tochen* exists as well. Therefore, it is best to act leniently only with cooked, soft vegetables; in this case, it is permissible to grind them even with the tines of a fork. Similarly, one may mix them (and even add sauce), but it is preferable to mix gently (in accordance with the ruling of the **Mishna Berura**). Similarly, it is permissible to mash **soft potatoes** with the tines of a fork and even to add sauce and mix them.

**If the vegetables are still a bit soft** and one needs to grind them also, it is best to be stringent in this regard (though one may grind with a *shinnui*). However, one may be lenient if one does this proximate to the meal, and in this case there is good reason to be lenient as regards *lisha* as well, in accordance with the ruling of the **Mishna Berura**. (Even the **Chazon Ish** does not decisively take the stringent approach, and it makes sense that we are talking about a doubt regarding rabbinic prohibition, where there is generally room for leniency.) If one does not need to grind them (e.g., one wants to add sauce to rice), it

appears that one may be lenient in this, as arises from the ruling of the **Mishna Berura**. (Furthermore, there is no clear *lisha* which combines disparate elements in this case, but rather the imparting of taste and moisture).

**Matza meal, tea-biscuit crumbs or breadcrumbs**, according to the Sefardim who rule like Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda, may be poured into a liquid and kneaded in a smaller quantity than the usual (since they have already been baked and they are edible as they are, similar to *kemach kali*). According to the Ashkenazim (and some of the Sefardim) who rule like Rabbi, one should not be lenient in this, unless one puts the liquid in before Shabbat (and then one may add liquid and knead with a smaller quantity than the norm). Similarly, one may be lenient and knead with a *shinnui*

**Lisha of Cooked Vegetables**

**Rambam: Permissible**

**Mishna Berura:** There is no prohibition of *lisha* for a cooked food. Apparently, the prohibition is to prepare food through *lisha* only, but if it is ready, the *lisha* is only *tikkun okhel*.

**Taz, Chazon Ish:** Because the vegetables have been cooked and softened, naturally there is no significant act of *lisha* which connects separate pieces; one merely mashes the different parts of the food so that they will be mixed more thoroughly.

According to this, one may perform *lisha* on any cooked food (but should do so gently).

According to this, it may be that one is allowed to do this only to soft pieces filled with liquid.

**Practical Halakha**

**Matza Meal, Tea-Biscuit Crumbs, Breadcrumbs:**

**Sefardim** (Rav Ovadya Yosef): One may be lenient and knead a small quantity each time (since they are edible) – but only a small quantity, so that one will not err and knead regular flour.

**Ashkenazim** (and some Sefardim): If water is put in before Shabbat, one may knead a small quantity each time. If not, one may not knead normally, but must employ a *shinnui* (as with every *lisha*).

cooked,  
somewhat  
hard Pieces:  
one may mash  
and mix only  
proximate to  
the meal  
because of  
the issue of  
*ochel* as  
well).

**Soft  
Cooked  
Pieces:**  
One may  
mash and  
mix  
gently  
and even  
add  
liquid.

## XII) Variations on *Lisha*

Does *lisha* apply when the liquid is a fruit's natural juice? May one knead cooked tomatoes in their own natural juices? May one mix the whipped-cream topping of a pudding cup with the chocolate below?

### **LISHA OF A COOKED FRUIT IN ITS NATURAL JUICE**

As we have already seen, mashing cooked produce does not carry a prohibition of *lash*; if it is soft, one can grind it even with the tines of a fork (and if it is not soft enough, one should mash it right before to the meal).

If a fruit or vegetable has not been cooked, we have seen that one should not grind it normally, but one may mash it with a *shinnui* (alteration) — for example with the handle of a fork or spoon. (Furthermore, if a banana or avocado has become very soft, one may be lenient and mash it even with the tines of a fork).

Once one has overcome the prohibition of *tochen*, grinding (for example, one has mashed it with a *shinnui*) and one has a pulped fruit — is it permissible to mix the fruit (or vegetable) with its own juice?

The **Chazon Ish** (58:8, s.v. *Yesh*) relates to this and writes:

It is possible that the act does not have the form of *lisha* unless one puts liquid into a dry substance; but when one crushes fruit, even though it coheres in its juices, there is no name of *lash* upon it. This appears correct.

According to this approach, there is no prohibition of *lisha* when one “kneads” a fruit in its own juice. There are two reasons for this: first of all, the prohibition of *lisha* is applicable only when one mixes liquid with a dry substance, whereas here the liquid is not being added but is already present naturally. Secondly, the prohibition of *lash* applies to an act in which the liquid gathers the parts of the dry substance and turns them into one; the *lisha* of a fruit, on the contrary, does not bind the parts together, but rather essentially degrades the form of the fruit, turning it into something softer.

Therefore, one may crush a fruit with a *shinnui*, and after that it is permissible to mix it in its natural juice (but not to add another liquid — **Chazon Ish** *ibid.* 9).

### **LISHA OF TWO SOLID MASSES**

A great innovation of **Rav S.Z. Auerbach** as regards the definition of *lash* produces many stringent ramifications. According to him, the prohibition of *lash* includes the mixing of **two solid masses**. For example, one would violate the prohibition of *lash* by taking **honey and soft cheese** and mixing them together. Rav Neuwirth cites his view in *Shemirat Shabbat Ke-hilkhata* (8:13-16):

It is forbidden to mix white cheese with honey, even if one's intent is to eat it immediately... It is forbidden to add sugar or even runny jam to soft cheese and to mix it.

However, it should be noted that this approach is not self-evident. Generally, the prohibition of *lash* applies to the mixing and binding of separate parts by liquid. The liquid makes the discrete parts form one body. However, when one mixes two solid masses, there is no one substance which binds the parts of the other substance; instead, there are two ingredients, each of which is already “kneaded” and cohesive. The mixing of these two masses serves only to integrate two tastes and the like (and as we have seen above, it is permissible to add liquids to an existing mass). Aside from this, we are talking about substances which are edible as is, so that the mixing is only mere *tikkun okhel* (food preparation) and not *lisha*, which is permissible, as we have seen previously in the words of the **Bei'ur Halakha**.

Indeed, **Rav Moshe Feinstein** (*Iggerot Moshe*, OC, Vol. IV, Ch. 74, *Lash*, 13) indicates that he is lenient about this:

Putting sour cream and the like into cottage cheese or cream cheese does not constitute *lisha*, and it is permissible.

Rav Karelitz (**Orechot Shabbat**, Ch. 6, n. 21) also writes that one is allowed to mix two solid masses. Furthermore, it is not clear in what circumstances **Rav S.Z. Auerbach** forbids this. His son, **Rav Azriel Auerbach** (cited by the **Shalmei Yehonatan**, 321:15 — 50, 6) believes that his father would forbid this only if the mixing creates an extremely high viscosity; however **if the consistency remains unchanged, it would be permissible**.

### **Practical Halakha**

We must differentiate between kneading a *belila ava* (thick mixture), which is forbidden by Torah law, and kneading a *belila rakka* (thin mixture), which is rabbinically banned. If it is a *belila ava*, one should forbid the mixing of two masses, and therefore it is good to be stringent and not to mix **honey in soft cheese** (i.e., that which cannot be poured), but if it is a *belila rakka*, it appears that one may be lenient about this. Similarly, one may be lenient when there is no additional viscosity created, particularly when one does so proximate to the meal, as this may be considered *tikkun okhel*, not *lisha*. All the more so, one may be lenient when the mixing is done **in the midst of eating**, and particularly when the resulting mixture is no more viscous than its constituent ingredients. Therefore, one may mix **the whipped-cream topping of a desert cup into the chocolate pudding on the bottom** and the like.

Similarly, one may be lenient and mix **mayonnaise and ketchup** in order to make salad dressing out of them, since we are talking about a *belila rakka*, particularly since the mixture is a **more fluid belila**, which can be used as a dressing. Clearly it is also permitted to add water in order to dilute it; as we have seen previously, one may add water even to dough, since this action is the opposite of *lisha* — it does not aim to bind and connect, but rather to loosen and separate.



**Sugar or cocoa in yogurt or soft cheese:** One may stir granular sugar or cocoa into yogurt, soft cheese and the like, because no solid mass is created here, nor is there any binding of parts. One only imparts taste to the yogurt. Even though Rav Neuwirth (*Shemirat Shabbat Ke-hilkhata* 8:16) forbids mixing sugar with soft cheese, this is a perplexing view. The **Orechot Shabbat** (6:43) disputes this and allows the practice; see the analysis of the **Shalmei Yehonatan** (321:15 — 50, 6).

**Hummus and tahini:** According to the lenient halakhic authorities, one may mix prepared hummus with prepared tahini, since this is the integration of two masses, each of which has already undergone *lisha* on its own. However, according to **Rav S.Z. Auerbach**, it would apparently be forbidden to mix them, since the tahini is made thicker as a result of the mixing. Nevertheless, according to his view, it would be permitted to put one on top of the other, since there is no mixture here, and the tahini does not permeate the hummus, so that there is no prohibition even according to the view of Rabbi. If one does not attempt to stir them, or if one merely dips bread into them, there would not be a problem according to any view, even if the tahini and hummus become mixed in the process.

**Mixing Two Solid Masses**

[There are no discrete parts which adhere due to liquid]

**Rav Feinstein, Rav Karelitz:** Permitted

**Rav Auerbach:** Forbidden

Practical Halakha

If mixing masses creates a *belila rakka*, one may be lenient.

Therefore one can make dressing from **ketchup, water and mayonnaise**, and one may put **honey into yogurt or leben**.

If mixing masses does not affect the consistency, it is permissible.

Therefore, it is permissible to mix the topping and pudding in a dessert cup, because there is no noticeable increase in viscosity; furthermore, this is done in the midst of eating.

If mixing masses creates a *belila ava*, one should be stringent.

This may at times be true of mixing tahini and hummus, but it is permissible to put one on top of the other and even to dip bread in it, even if the two become mixed.

Therefore, it is appropriate to be stringent and not put honey or jam on soft cheese.

### XIII) A Case Study: Preparing Egg Salad

How may one prepare egg salad on Shabbat? According to the basic rules we have learned for the *melakha* of *lash*, it would seem that preparing such a salad would be forbidden.

Before addressing the issues of *lash*, let us address the issues of *borer* (selecting) and *tochen*. In order to make egg salad, one must take hard-boiled eggs and break them down; to avoid problems of *borer* and *tochen*, one should peel the eggs close to mealtime, and one may then mash the eggs even with the tines of a fork. Then, one cuts an onion into small pieces; once again, to avoid the prohibition of *tochen*, one should do so proximate to mealtime, and it is better to cut the onion into somewhat large pieces.

After that, one adds oil or mayonnaise and mixes everything together. This would seem to involve a violation of *lisha* since the egg is broken down into very small pieces, and the mayonnaise or the oil make the pieces cohere as one solid mass.

Despite this, egg salad is a staple of **many Shabbat tables**. **Rav S.Z. Auerbach** (cited in *Shemirat Shabbat Ke-Hilkhata*, Ch. 8, n. 81) attempts to defend this custom:

One may say that since one only wants to mix, and one is careful not to make it into one mass, this is not considered by Torah law to be a *belila ava...*

The **Mishna Berura**, 68, is stringent even when it comes to a mixture of radishes or cucumbers together with vinegar, even though there as well one is careful that they will not stick together. Nevertheless, we must consider the fact that the egg is already cooked... and the onion and the oil are only a sort of garnish, as the Mishna Berura has written...

When it comes to grits, which are considered already baked and cooked, even if one puts in a liquid and kneads them, it is not considered like *lash*, only mere *tikkun okhel*, and the same is true here...

Other factors to consider are that this spoils [if prepared in advance] and that one generally prepares it only proximate to eating, so that it may be considered like *al yad* as a result... The reason that it is permitted is because it is *derekh akhila* (the way of eating) and not akin to *lash*.

Therefore, it appears that one cannot challenge the customary practice of so many who excel in Torah and piety.

Rav Auerbach thus enumerates a number of reasons to be lenient:

1. There is no aim of creating one mass, but only to mix and impart flavor.
2. The egg is already cooked, so that according to the **Bei'ur Halakha** there is no prohibition of *lash* upon it. The onion and the oil, which have not been cooked, are only a garnish for the egg, and therefore it is considered ***tikkun okhel*** and not akin to *lisha*.
3. This food spoils if it is prepared ahead of time, and it is always prepared proximate to the meal; this is another reason to see its preparation as *tikkun okhel* and not as *lisha*.

Rav Neuwirth adds (ibid.) that we may enlist those who believe that if the egg is not of the crumbly consistency of flour, there is no prohibition of *lash* in this (**Eshel Avraham** II, Ch. 321).

However since these explanations are not compellingly straightforward, it is best to prepare egg salad with a *shinnui* (this is the ruling of Rav Neuwirth, *Shemirat Shabbat Ke-hilkhata* ibid. 23). In other words, one should put the oil in first and then the egg; if one is using mayonnaise, there is no problem, because it does not permeate. Then, one should mix *sheti ve-erev* (crosswise), instead of using a circular motion. (In fact, it makes sense that in this case one may be lenient and **mix normally, just gently**, as many are lenient when it comes to pulped vegetables; even though the egg is not a vegetable, it has been cooked, and there are many other reasons to be lenient).

To summarize, **many are lenient when it comes to preparing egg salad on Shabbat**, and they have on whom to rely, but one should prepare it proximate to the meal (and one should preferably cut the onions into somewhat large pieces). However, if possible, it is best to mix with a *shinnui* (*sheti ve-erev* or gently).

## XIV) Instant Foods

Is one allowed to make instant soup, pasta or mashed potatoes on Shabbat? How may one prepare instant baby food or formula on Shabbat?

We must note that aside from the issue of *lash*, preparation of these foods needs to avoid the *melakha* of *bishul* (cooking). To summarize the conclusion of my analysis as pertinent to this discussion, one may not prepare these in a primary vessel (the one “on the fire”) or in secondary vessel (which one pours into from the primary vessel), there is room to do so in a tertiary vessel (poured into from the secondary vessel). (Nevertheless, it is best not to do this regularly, since this resembles cooking on Shabbat.) In cases where the *bishul* issue has been overcome, the question then arises: is there a problem of *lisha* in preparing instant food?

To answer this, we must differentiate among three types:

1. If the instant food is a liquid, such as soup, or of similar consistency, there is generally no problem of *lisha*.
2. If the instant food consists of pasta with sauce and the like, it may be as liquid as soup; but at times, the mixture is more viscous, and the sauce makes the pasta cohere.
3. If the instant food consists of a powder, the water may sometimes turn the powder into a very thick mass; this is the case with instant **mashed potatoes (potato puree)**. In this case of a ***belila ava*** (thick mixture), sometimes the very addition of water creates the *belila*, without any further action, and sometimes there is a need to stir it so that a mass will form.

In the second case — e.g., pasta with tomato sauce — the resultant **mixture** can be pourable and thus defined as a *belila rakka* (thin mixture), and sometimes it is defined as a *belila ava*. A ***belila rakka*** may be created with a *shinnui* (alteration), according to the rules we mentioned in our previous *shiurim*. In other words, **one must alter the sequence of ingredients** — instead of putting boiling water in a container of instant food, one should empty the contents into another vessel, pour hot water into the now-empty container and afterwards put the instant food back into its container. In addition, one should do the **mixing with a *shinnui***, e.g., ***sheti ve-erev*** (crosswise).

Nonetheless, even if the resultant mixture is a ***belila ava***, one may be lenient and prepare it with a *shinnui*, because generally speaking, instant food cannot be prepared on Erev Shabbat, as it will be cold and unappetizing by mealtime on Shabbat. As we have explained in previous *shiurim*, one should stir the *belila* with a *shinnui*, and it is desirable to change the sequence of ingredients.

### When Stirring is Unnecessary

If the instant food consists of a powder which becomes a thick mass on its own after hot water is added — e.g., potato puree — it is questionable whether a *shinnui* renders the *lisha* permissible. The Gemara in **Zevachim** (94b) discusses sowing flaxseed in water. In the Gemara, it is explained that there is a prohibition of *lash*, since the flaxseeds stick to each other. The **Rambam** (8:16) rules:

Whoever puts sesame seed, flaxseed and the like in water is liable because of *lash*, as they mix and adhere to each other.

It would stand to reason that this ruling is based on the view of **Rabbi**, who believes that the very act of putting flour into water makes one liable because of *lash*. According to **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, who believes that one is liable only for actual kneading, even one who puts flaxseed in water would not be liable. However, we have not found in the Gemara or in the writings of the *Rishonim* that **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda** challenges this law, and the implication is that it applies according to all views. Similarly, the **Rambam** and other *Rishonim* rule in accordance with the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, yet they also rule that one is liable for putting flaxseed into water. This is also the view of the **Shulchan Arukh** (340:12).

In light of this, it seems that all agree that if by adding water alone a **true mass is created**, this constitutes a violation of the *melakha* of *lash*. When one puts flour into water, a true mass is not created; therefore, according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, one is not liable until one kneads the mixture. However, putting flaxseed into water creates a fully blended mixture and a true mass, and there is no need for additional kneading or stirring; therefore, this act is viewed as an act of *lisha* — on a Torah level — according to all views.

This case would seem to be similar to **instant foods which do not require stirring to form a mass**. Here too, the very act of adding liquid to the powder creates an agglomerated mass. As we have said, creating a mass in this way is forbidden by the Torah according to all views. Does a *shinnui* help here?

The Gemara does not explicitly address whether, in the case of putting flaxseed into water, a *shinnui* makes the act permissible. From a logical point of view, it appears that a *shinnui* in mixing will certainly not suffice here, because the mass is created before the stirring, and only a ***shinnui* in ingredient sequence** would be effective. As we have seen, this *shinnui*, which is not a total *shinnui*, is effective only for a ***belila rakka***, which is rabbinically prohibited, and not for a ***belila ava***, which may not be kneaded by Torah law. However, is this *shinnui* effective also according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda** (whose view is considered authoritative by the letter of the law)?

In a previous *shiur*, we saw an argument of the *Acharonim* as to whether a

*shinnui* in ingredient sequence is effective only according to the view of **Rabbi**, or even according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**. According to the view of the **Terumat Ha-deshen** (Ch. 53) and the **Rema** (321:16), this *shinnui* is not effective according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, and only a *shinnui* of kneading is effective according to his view. The **Mishna Berura** (68) seems to confirm this. The **Shulchan Arukh** (321:14), on the other hand, indicates that a *shinnui* in ingredient sequence is effective even according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**, and this is the view of the **Chazon Ish** (58:5, s.v. *U-mashma*).

Yet, it stands to reason that in the case of putting flaxseed into water, all will agree that a *shinnui* in ingredient sequence would help, even according to the view of **Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda**. Only when the mass is created at the time of kneading is there an argument to say that a *shinnui* at the stage of adding ingredients is not effective, because this stage is not part of the *lisha*, and this is what the **Terumat Ha-deshen** and the **Rema** maintain. However, **when the mass is created on its own by putting in water**, and the very act of adding water makes one liable for *lash* according to all views, as explained above, **it makes sense that Rabbi Yosei bar Yehuda would concede that a *shinnui* at this stage is effective**, because this is a stage which makes one liable for *lash*.

According to this, one may be lenient and add hot water to a powder which will then form a mass on its own if one changes the ingredient sequence, and on the condition that we are talking about a *belila rakka*. This is what **Rav Moshe Feinstein** (*Iggerot Moshe*, OC, Vol. IV, Ch. 74, *Lash*, 12) indicates:

Is it permissible to prepare instant potatoes or instant pudding by a *shinnui* of putting in the water afterwards and a *shinnui* of the mixing?

Answer: Instant potatoes are forbidden in any case, but one may prepare instant pudding as a *belila rakka* if one puts in the water afterwards and mixes it with a *shinnui*. For a *belila ava*, it is forbidden in every way.

According to this view, one may prepare **pudding** on Shabbat, even though it forms on its own after the addition of water, on the condition that it will be made as a very fluid pudding, so that it will be considered a *belila rakka*. Furthermore, **one must alter the sequence of adding ingredients** (if one wants to stir, one should stir with a *shinnui*).

On the other hand, Rav Feinstein forbids preparing potato puree from a powder, since the *belila* is created on its own without stirring, and this *belila* is *ava*. In this case, a *shinnui* in the method of mixing will not be effective, since the mass is created before the stirring occurs, and a *shinnui* of ingredient sequence will not be effective, since this *shinnui* is not effective for a *belila ava*.

However, if it is impossible to prepare the puree before Shabbat, and one

wants to prepare it on Shabbat itself, (for example, one is stuck for Shabbat in a place with no prepared meals), one should prepare the puree with a lot of water, so that it will be runny and considered a *belila rakka*. In this case, one may be lenient **on the condition that one puts the water in first and afterwards the powder** (the reverse order from the weekday) and if one wants to stir, one should stir with a *shinnui*, i.e., *sheti ve-erev* instead of a circular motion.

#### Gelatin Desserts

**Gelatin desserts** would apparently be similar to instant potato puree, in that it hardens on its own and becomes a *belila ava*, so that it would be forbidden to make them on Shabbat. This is what the **Shevet Ha-levi** writes (Vol. VII, Ch. 41). However, it may be that the case of a gelatin dessert is different, since there is no mass per se (as with pudding); rather the powder dissolves in its entirety and becomes fluid, and after that it congeals **on its own**, so that there may be no prohibition of *lash* at all. This is what the **Orechot Shabbat** (Ch. 6, n. 83) writes; nevertheless, he indicates that it should be forbidden because of *uvdin de-chol* (a weekday practice — something inappropriate for Shabbat but not falling under the rubric of any particular *melakha*). Practically, allowing this is very questionable, and therefore one should not make gelatin desserts on Shabbat. However, in a case of great need, if one prepares the gelatin desserts with a very soft consistency and also alters the sequence of ingredients, there are opinions on which one may rely in order to prepare it.

#### Baby Food

When one prepares **instant cereal for infants**, one is often dealing with a **powder which forms a mass on its own**, and if so one may prepare it as a *belila rakka* (pourable) if one changes the ingredient sequence, and this is the preferable practice. However, many times we are dealing with a granular substance **which requires additional stirring**; therefore, the law will be that of a regular *belila*: one may prepare it **for an infant** with a *shinnui* even if the *belila* is *ava* (as we explained previously).

When one is preparing **formula for a baby** — i.e., powdered milk — generally it is very fluid (even if it is a bit thicker than coffee or chocolate milk). Therefore, it does not even rise to the level of a *belila rakka*, and one may prepare it on Shabbat normally, without any *shinnui* (one should first put in the hot water and afterwards the powder, to avoid a concern of *bishul*). If the liquid is more viscous and defined as a *belila rakka*, one should prepare it with a *shinnui*.

**Preparing Instant Food**

Instant food (liquid like soup)

Instant food (pasta with sauce)

Powder creates a mass without a need for mixing

**Powders**

Baby Foods

Dense mass

Fluid mass

Baby cereal

Baby formula

It may be prepared normally.

If it cannot be prepared before Shabbat, change the ingredient sequence (empty the container, put in water, and put the contents back in), mixing crosswise

It may not be prepared on Shabbat (even with a *shinnui*). Therefore, one should not prepare potato puree pudding made from powder, if they are dense.

One may prepare with a *shinnui* in ingredient sequence (if stirring, it must be with a *shinnui*). To make potato puree from powder, make it pourable, with lots of water and the abovementioned *shinnuyim*.

If the mass forms without stirring, its status is the same: one should make a *belila rakka* with a *shinnui*. If the mass does not form on its own, but requires mixing, one may be lenient even for a *belila ava* with two *shinnuyim*.

If it is very fluid, one may prepare it normally (and this is the common reality). If it is dense, one should prepare it with a *shinnui*.